

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIRCUIT**

NATIONAL PARKS CONSERVATION	)	
ASSOCIATION and	)	
SIERRA CLUB,	)	
	)	
Petitioners,	)	
	)	
v.	)	No. 12-1425
	)	
UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL	)	
PROTECTION AGENCY and LISA P.	)	
JACKSON, Administrator, United States	)	
Environmental Protection Agency,	)	
	)	
Respondents.	)	

---

**NONBINDING STATEMENT OF ISSUES FOR NATIONAL PARKS  
CONSERVATION ASSOCIATION AND SIERRA CLUB**

In accordance with this Court's order issued on October 26, 2012,  
Petitioners National Parks Conservation Association and Sierra Club submit the  
following nonbinding statement setting forth the issues they intend to raise in the  
above-captioned matter:

1. Whether the Environmental Protection Agency's final action authorizing each of the 28 states participating in the trading programs established under the Cross-State Air Pollution Rule ("CSAPR") to substitute compliance with that rule for requiring certain electric generating units to install and operate the Best Available Retrofit Technology ("BART") is arbitrary, capricious, an abuse of

discretion, or otherwise not in accordance with law or in excess of statutory authority. 42 U.S.C. § 7607(d)(9)(A), (C); 5 U.S.C. § 706(2)(A), (C).

2. Whether the Environmental Protection Agency's decision to issue Federal Implementation Plans for Georgia, Indiana, Iowa, Kentucky, Michigan, Missouri, Ohio, Pennsylvania, South Carolina, Tennessee, Virginia, and West Virginia that allow participation in the CSAPR trading programs to substitute for installation and operation of BART is arbitrary, capricious, an abuse of discretion, or otherwise not in accordance with law or in excess of statutory authority. 42 U.S.C. § 7607(d)(9)(A), (C); 5 U.S.C. § 706(2)(A), (C).

3. Whether the Environmental Protection Agency's decision authorizing the use of CSAPR, which at the time was subject to challenge and had been stayed and which has now been vacated, as an alternative to BART was arbitrary and capricious and exceeded the Agency's authority under the Clean Air Act and implementing regulations, which require State and Federal Implementation Plans to include enforceable emissions limitations and other control measures, 42 U.S.C. §§ 7410(a)(2)(A), (C); 40 C.F.R. § 51.308(d)(3), *id.* Pt. 51, App. Y, § V. See 42 U.S.C. § 7607(d)(9)(A), (C); 5 U.S.C. § 706(2)(A), (C).

Dated: November 26, 2012

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Thomas Cmar

Thomas Cmar  
EARTHJUSTICE  
5042 N. Leavitt Street, Suite 1  
Chicago, IL 60625  
312-257-9338  
[tcmar@earthjustice.org](mailto:tcmar@earthjustice.org)

Jocelyn D'Ambrosio  
EARTHJUSTICE  
156 William Street, Suite 800  
New York, New York 10038  
212-845-7376  
[jdambrsio@earthjustice.org](mailto:jdambrsio@earthjustice.org)

*Counsel for Petitioners National Parks  
Conservation Association and Sierra  
Club*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Thomas Cmar, hereby certify that I have this day served a true and correct copy of the foregoing Nonbinding Statement of Issues for National Parks Conservation Association and Sierra Club through the Court's electronic case filing system on the following:

C. Frederick Beckner, III  
rbeckner@sidley.com

Norman William Fichthorn  
nfichthorn@hunton.com

David Michael Flannery  
dmflannery@jacksonkelly.com

Aaron Michael Flynn  
flynna@hunton.com

Peter S. Glaser  
peter.glaser@troutmansanders.com

Peter Douglas Keisler  
pkeisler@sidley.com

Edward Louis Kropp  
skropp@jacksonkelly.com

Roger Romulus Martella, Jr.  
rmartella@sidley.com

Norman Louis Rave, Jr.  
norman.rave@usdoj.gov

Gale Lea Rubrecht  
galelea@jacksonkelly.com

Valerie Marie Tachtiris  
Valerie.Tachtiris@atg.in.gov

Mark L. Walters  
Mark.Walters@texasattorneygeneral.gov

Timothy Kenly Webster  
twebster@sidley.com

And by first-class mail on the following:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Ariel Rios Building  
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20460

Lisa Perez Jackson  
Administrator  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Ariel Rios Building  
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20460

Dated: November 26, 2012

/s/ Thomas Cmar

Thomas Cmar  
EARTHJUSTICE  
5042 N. Leavitt Street, Suite 1  
Chicago, IL 60625  
312-257-9338  
tcmar@earthjustice.org